

INTEGRATION OF KNOWLEDGE AND IDEAS

ANCHOR 9

English Language Arts Standards Reading: Literature **Anchor 9**

Reading Anchor 9: Analyze how two or more texts address similar themes or topics to build knowledge or to compare the approaches the authors take.

K	First	Second	Third	Fourth	Fifth
With prompting and support, compare and contrast the adventures and experiences of characters in familiar stories.	Compare and contrast the adventures and experiences of characters in stories.	Compare and contrast two or more versions of the same story (e.g., Cinderella stories) by different authors or from different cultures.	Compare and contrast the themes, settings, and plots of stories written by the same author about the same or similar characters (e.g., in books from a series).	Compare and contrast the treatment of similar themes and topics (e.g., opposition of good and evil) and patterns of events (e.g., the quest) in stories, myths, and traditional literature from different cultures.	Compare and contrast stories in the same genre (e.g., mysteries, and adventure stories) on their approaches to similar themes and topics.

Demonstration 129

Collaborative Engagement 138

Independent Application 140

Decision Tree for **Reading: Literature** ANCHOR 9

Do my students need focused instruction in relation to Reading Anchor 9?

Anchor 9 requires that students *compare, contrast, and integrate* information from different texts. (Refer to your grade-level standards for specific details.)

When some or all of your students could use support in this area, it is recommended that you start the process by implementing three types of instruction in sequence over the course of about a week:



Demonstration
Page 129



Collaborative Engagement
Page 138



Independent Application
Page 140

The initial demonstration requires just one session (to be repeated as needed), leaving one or two days for collaborative engagement and one or two days to begin the independent applications, which become ongoing as you choose. If you find during any phase of the instruction that some or all of your students could use intensified support, it is recommended that you move to the lessons for intensifying the instruction.



Do my students need intensified support with making connections between texts?

Because making connections between texts is so important to children's development of all kinds of knowledge, just about any student can benefit from intensified instruction in this area. English learners especially can benefit, as working with two texts that have related content provides an opportunity for repeated use of vocabulary that is focused on a particular topic. See page 137.

Demonstration

Anchor 9 requires that students *compare, contrast, and integrate information from different texts*. When working with literature (fiction), this generally involves comparing and contrasting settings, characters, events, plots, and themes. The present lesson is designed to help K–5 students meet this goal through meaningful reading. This lesson may be implemented several times, using a different text set each time.

1. **Choose the text set.** A text set is a grouping of two or more texts that are related in some way, such as by topic, theme, or genre. For this lesson, choose two texts that will allow students to explore the key narrative elements recommended for your grade level. Figure RL 9.2 features a recommended list matched with the common core grade-level elements. Allow at least two days for the lesson.
2. **Introduce the texts and the concept.** Show students the texts, indicating that you will be reading them over the course of two days and comparing them on some key elements. Let them know the elements you will be focusing on (as listed in Figure RL 9.2).
3. **Demonstrate and discuss the concept.** On day one, read the first book and place an emphasis on discussing your focus element. For example, if you teach kindergarten or first grade, emphasize attention to the characters' adventures. If you teach fourth or fifth grade, emphasize attention to the topic or theme. On day two, introduce the second book, reminding students that you will be comparing it with the first on the focus element. Read the text, focusing your discussion on comparing and contrasting the elements across books. Figure RL 9.1 offers a starter set of prompts.

Figure RL 9.1

READING ANCHOR 9:
Prompts to Support Teacher-Led Modeling and Discussion

Kindergarten and First Grade

Let's compare the adventures/experiences of the two main characters in our two books.
(Figure RL 9.3 provides a template for drawing and writing.)

- Overall, what is similar about the two stories. Let's state that in one sentence starting with "Both stories. . ."
- Who are the main characters we are comparing?
- What kinds of adventures/experiences do both characters have? How are the experiences similar/different?

(continues)

Second Grade

- Let's compare and contrast the two stories. (Figure RL 9.3 and 9.4 provide templates.)
- Overall, what is similar about the two stories? Let's state that in one sentence starting with "Both stories are about..."
- What is similar/different about the settings?
- What major problem or goal do the two main characters face? How are these similar/different? How are their responses to the problem/goal similar or different?
- How do other characters respond to these characters? Do you notice similarities in the way the two characters are treated?
- How are the endings similar or different?

Third Grade

- Let's compare and contrast the (plot, setting, themes) of the two stories. (Figures RL 9.4 and 9.5 provide templates.)
- Overall, what is similar about the two stories? Let's state that in one sentence starting with "Both stories..."
- What is similar/different about the themes?
- What is similar/different about the settings?
- What major problem or goal do the two main characters face? How are these similar/different? How are their responses to the problem/goal similar or different?
- How do other characters respond to these characters? Do you notice similarities in the way the two characters are treated?
- How are the endings similar or different?

Fourth and Fifth Grades

- Let's compare and contrast the ways the two authors portray the (themes, topics) of the two stories. (Figures RL 9.4 and RL 9.5 provide templates.)
- What do we think is the central theme or message (or topic) in each story? How are the messages/themes/content similar/different?
- How does each author convey the theme/address the topic?

Figure RL 9.2

Recommended Literature for Comparing and Contrasting		
Grade	Elements	Recommended Text Sets
K	Compare and contrast the adventures and experiences of characters in familiar stories.	<p>Spunky Kids <i>It Takes a Village</i> (Jane Cowen-Fletcher) <i>Oh, No, Toto!</i> (Katrin Hyman Tchana and Louise Tchana Pami) <i>No, David!</i> (David Shannon)</p> <p>Spunky Pets <i>Mittens</i> (Lola Schaefer) <i>Cookie's Week</i> (Cindy Ward)</p> <p>Cumulative Tales—Animals Sharing Space <i>Move Over, Rover!</i> (Karen Beaumont) <i>The Mitten</i> (Jan Brett)</p> <p>Cumulative Tales—Voracious Cats <i>Gobble, Gobble, Slip, Slop: A Tale of a Very Greedy Cat</i> (Meilo So) <i>Fat Cat: A Danish Folk Tale</i> (Margaret Read MacDonald)</p> <p>Friendships Across Borders <i>Yo! Yes?</i> (Chris Raschka) <i>The Knight and the Dragon</i> (Tomie DePaola)</p> <p>Mother Separated from Young <i>Stellaluna</i> (Janell Canon) <i>Owl Babies</i> (Martin Waddell)</p>
1	Compare and contrast the adventures and experiences of characters in stories.	<p>Spunky Kids <i>Lilly's Purple Plastic Purse</i> (Kevin Henkes) <i>Too Many Tamales</i> (Gary Soto) <i>Shortcut</i> (Donald Crews)</p> <p>Spunky Pets <i>Good Boy, Fergus!</i> (David Shannon) <i>Muldoon</i> (Pamela Duncan Edwards) <i>Catch That Goat!</i> (Polly Alakija)</p> <p>Stray Animals <i>The Stray Dog</i> (Marc Simont) <i>McDuff Moves In</i> (Rosemary Wells)</p> <p>Sharing Food <i>Mama Panya's Pancakes: A Village Tale from Kenya</i> (Mary Chamberlain) <i>Stone Soup</i> (John Muth)</p> <p>Friendships Across Cultures <i>The Other Side</i> (Jacqueline Woodson) <i>Henry and the Kite Dragon</i> (Bruce Edward Hall)</p>

(continues)

Figure RL 9.2 (continued)

1	Compare and contrast the adventures and experiences of characters in stories.	<p>Fantasy Flights <i>Chavela and the Magic Bubble</i> (Monica Brown) <i>Abuela</i> (Arthur Dorros) <i>Tar Beach</i> (Faith Ringgold)</p> <p>Finding Beauty in the Home Environment <i>Something Beautiful</i> (Sharon Dennis Wyeth) <i>All the Places to Love</i> (Patricia MacLachlan)</p>
2	Compare and contrast two or more versions of the same story by different authors or from different cultures.	<p>Cinderella Text Set for Second Grade <i>Cinderella</i> (James Marshall) <i>Mufaro's Beautiful Daughters: An African Tale</i> (Jon Steptoe) <i>Yeh-Shen: A Cinderella Story from China</i> (Ai-Ling Louie) <i>The Rough-Face Girl</i> (Rafe Martin) <i>The Golden Sandal: A Middle Eastern Cinderella Story</i> (Rebecca Hickox)</p> <p>Little Red Riding Hood Text Set for Second Grade <i>Little Red Riding Hood</i> (Jerry Pinkney) <i>Lon Po Po: A Red Riding Hood Story from China</i> (Ed Young) <i>Pretty Salma: A Little Red Riding Hood Story from Africa</i> (Niki Daly) <i>Little Red Riding Hood</i> (Trina Schart Hyman) <i>Little Red Riding Hood: A New Fangled Prairie Tale</i> (Lisa Campbell Ernst)</p> <p>The Three Little Pigs Text Set for Second Grade <i>The Three Little Hawaiian Pigs and the Magic Shark</i> (Donivee Martin Laird) <i>The Three Little Pigs</i> (James Marshall) <i>The True Story of the Three Little Pigs</i> (Jon Scieszka) <i>The Three Little Wolves and the Big Bad Pig</i> (Eugene Trivizas) <i>The Three Little Javelinas</i> (Susan Lowell)</p>
3	Compare and contrast the themes, settings, and plots of stories written by the same author about the same or similar characters.	<p>Author Sets <i>A Chair for My Mother</i> (Vera B. Williams) <i>Something Special for Me</i> (Vera B. Williams) <i>Junkyard Wonders</i> (Patricia Polacco) <i>Thank You, Mr. Falker</i> (Patricia Polacco) <i>Rotten Richie and the Ultimate Dare</i> (Patricia Polacco) <i>My Rotten, Redheaded Older Brother</i> (Patricia Polacco) <i>Dear Mrs. LaRue</i> (Mark Teague) <i>LaRue for Mayor</i> (Mark Teague) <i>The Table Where Rich People Sit</i> (Byrd Baylor) <i>The Desert Is Theirs</i> (Byrd Baylor) <i>Mercy Watson Goes for a Ride</i> (Kate DiCamillo) <i>Mercy Watson to the Rescue</i> (Kate DiCamillo) <i>Flossie and the Fox</i> (Patricia McKissack) <i>Precious and the Boo Hag</i> (Patricia McKissack)</p>

Figure RL 9.2 (continued)

4	Compare and contrast the treatment of similar themes and topics in stories, myths, and traditional literature from different cultures.	<p>Related Stories Collections <i>When Birds Could Talk and Bats Could Sing</i> (told by Virginia Hamilton). A collection of traditional folktales from the southern United States, all centered around birds.</p> <p><i>The People Could Fly: American Black Folktales</i> (Virginia Hamilton). A collection divided into four topic areas: animal tales, fanciful tales, supernatural tales, and slave tales.</p> <p><i>Favorite Greek Myths</i> (retold by Mary Pope Osborne). A collection of Greek myths featuring many of the best-known characters.</p> <p><i>Keepers of the Animals</i> (Michael Caduto and Joseph Bruchac). A collection of traditional Native American stories emphasizing the interdependence of living things.</p>
5	Compare and contrast stories in the same genre on their approaches to similar themes and topics.	<p>Biographical Information on Martin Luther King <i>Martin's Big Words</i> (Doreen Rappaport) <i>My Brother Martin</i> (Christine King Farris)</p> <p>Issues of Slavery and Freedom <i>January's Sparrow</i> (Patricia Polacco) <i>Pink and Say</i> (Patricia Polacco)</p> <p>Escape from Slavery <i>Henry's Freedom Box</i> (Ellen Levine) <i>Ain't Nobody a Stranger to Me</i> (Ann Grifalconi) <i>Night Boat to Freedom</i> (Margot Theis Raven)</p> <p>Children Learning About Civil Rights <i>Grandmama's Pride</i> (Becky Birtha) <i>A Sweet Smell of Roses</i> (Angela Johnson)</p> <p>Gender Issues <i>She's Wearing a Dead Bird on Her Head</i> (Kathryn Lasky) <i>Roses Sing on New Snow</i> (Paul Yee)</p> <p>Issues of Poverty <i>Fly Away Home</i> (Eve Bunting) <i>An Angel for Solomon Singer</i> (Cynthia Rylant)</p> <p>Conservation <i>The Great Kapok Tree</i> (Lynne Cherry) <i>The People Who Hugged the Trees</i> (adapted by Deborah Lee Rose)</p> <p>The Meaning of "Rich" <i>The Gold Coin</i> (Alma Flor Ada) <i>The Table Where Rich People Sit</i> (Byrd Baylor) <i>The Greatest Treasure</i> (Demi)</p>